arXiv:1508.07406v4 [hep-ph] 2 Dec 2015

New Mixing Angles in the Left-Right Symmetric Model

Akira Kokado*
Department of Physical Therapy, Kobe International University, Kobe 658-0032, Japan

Takesi Saito†
Department of Physics, Kwansei Gakuin University, Sanda 669-1337, Japan

(Dated: December 3, 2015)

In the left-right symmetric model neutral gauge fields are characterized by three mixing angles $\theta_{12}, \theta_{23}, \theta_{13}$ between three gauge fields $B_\mu, W^3_{L\mu}, W^3_{R\mu}$, which produce mass eigenstates A_μ, Z_μ, Z'_μ, when $G = SU(2)_L \times SU(2)_R \times U(1)_{B-L} \times D$ is spontaneously broken down until $U(1)_{em}$. We find a new mixing angle θ', which corresponds to the Weinberg angle θ_W in the standard model with the $SU(2)_L \times U(1)_Y$ gauge symmetry, from these mixing angles. It is then shown that any mixing angle θ_{ij} can be expressed by ε and θ', where $\varepsilon = g_L/g_R$ is a ratio of running left-right gauge coupling strengths. We observe that light gauge bosons are described by θ' only, whereas heavy gauge bosons are described by two parameters ε and θ'.

PACS numbers: 12.15.Ff, 14.70.-e

I. INTRODUCTION

Since the discovery of neutrino oscillations [1], many new physics beyond the standard model have been proposed in an accelerative way. Among these works the left-right symmetric model (LRSM)[2–8] appears to be one of the most promising models, which is invariant under the gauge group $G = SU(2)_L \times SU(2)_R \times U(1)_{B-L} \times D$, where D denotes D-parity symmetry and $g_L = g_R$ for left-right gauge strengths. The smallness of neutrino masses is one of the most important problems to be solved. The so-called seesaw mechanism [9–11] is naturally incorporated in the model, where neutrinos are regarded as Majorana particles. The original gauge group G is first broken down to $SU(2)_L \times SU(2)_R \times U(1)_{B-L}$ at an energy scale $\langle\, \eta \,\rangle = M_P \sim 10^{15}$ GeV, where η is the pseudoscalar Higgs field, so that D-parity invariance is broken because of the Higgs potential including $\triangle_L$ and $\triangle_R$. Then at the energy scale $\langle\, \triangle_R \,\rangle = V_R \sim 10^3$ GeV the $SU(2)_R$ invariance is broken until $SU(2)_L \times U(1)_Y$, and finally at the energy scale$\langle\, \phi \,\rangle = \kappa_{1,2} \sim 10^2$ GeV the last symmetry is broken until the $U(1)_{em}$ invariance. As a result of running couplings we have $g_L \neq g_R$ [2]. At this point there are some papers with $g_L = g_R$ in any energy scale [12], whereas our paper is not so.

However, except for ambiguity associated with Higgs field, some unsolved problems remain in various gauge fields. Light gauge bosons $W^\pm$ and Z are associated with their partners $W'^\pm$ and Z' which are too heavy to observe. For charged gauge bosons $W^\pm$ and $W'^\pm$ they are characterized by one mixing angle γ. On the other hand, for neutral gauge fields they are characterized by three mixing angles $\theta_{12}, \theta_{23}, \theta_{13}$ between three gauge fields $B_\mu, W^3_{L\mu}, W^3_{R\mu}$, which produce mass eigenstates A_μ, Z_μ, Z'_μ. In addition there are free gauge parameters g_L, g_R and g_1 of G.

Now we are faced with problems how to fix these parameters from experimental data presently available such as $W^\pm, Z$. Apparently some of parameters remain unfixed, until when we have data from their heavy partners $W'^\pm, Z'$.

In this paper we discuss these problems. The mass matrix for neutral gauge fields will be diagonal

---

*Electronic address: kokado@kobe-kiu.ac.jp
†Electronic address: tsaito@k7.dion.ne.jp

if $\tan\theta_{23} = -\sin\theta_{12}\sin\theta_{13}/\cos\theta_{12} + O(\delta)$, where δ is an infinitesimally small parameter associated with the spontaneously broken left-right symmetry. In $\delta \sim 0$, then introducing a new mixing angle θ' defined by $s' = \sin\theta_{12}\cos\theta_{13}$ and $c' = \cos\theta_{12}/\cos\theta_{23}$ with $s'^2 + c'^2 = 1$ (s', c' stand for $\sin\theta', \cos\theta'$, respectively), we show that all light gauge boson masses can be expressed in terms of s', c', namely, $M_W = 37.3/s'$ GeV and $M_Z/M_W = 1/c'$. The coupling strength between the proton and the Z boson as well as those of neutrinos and Z can be shown to be expressed also by s', c'. All results are completely the same as those of the Weinberg-Salam (WS) theory with $SU(2)_L \times U(1)_Y$, in $\delta \sim 0$, if we take $s' = \sin\theta_W$, $c' = \cos\theta_W$, where θ_W is the Weinberg angle. Here WS gauge coupling constants g, g' are given by $g = g_L = e_0/\sin\theta_W$ and $g' = g_1\cos\theta_{13}\cos\theta_{23} = e_0/\cos\theta_W$ with e_0 the positron charge, respectively. These results happen to be around mass scales of weak gauge bosons M_W, M_Z.

We will also show that any mixing angle θ_{ij} can be expressed in terms of $\theta' = \theta_W$ and $\varepsilon = g_L/g_R$ in $\delta \sim 0$.

Finally we discuss about the gauge coupling ratio ε, which is given by angles as $\varepsilon^2 = s'^{-2} - \sin\theta_{12}{}^{-2}$. Hence we cannot fix ε by s' only. We then observe generally that light gauge bosons are described by θ' only, whereas heavy gauge bosons are described by two parameters ε and θ'.

In Secs.II and III we summarize the LRSM in order to fix the notation. In Secs.IV and V masses of gauge bosons are calculated in the order of δ. In Secs.VI we discuss mixing angles. In the Appendix we calculate the electromagnetic coupling strength with fermions, and also the coupling strength between the proton and the Z boson. The final section is devoted to concluding remarks.

II. THE LEFT-RIGHT SYMMETRIC MODEL

Let us summarize the LRSM proposed first in Ref. [2], which is invariant under the gauge group

$$G = SU(2)_L \times SU(2)_R \times U(1)_{B-L} \times D \ . \tag{2.1}$$

The representation of G is characterized by the triplet (d_L, d_R, Y), where d_L, d_R denote the dimensions of $SU(2)_L$ and $SU(2)_R$, respectively, and Y is defined by $Q = I_{3L} + I_{3R} + Y/2$ in familiar notations and is equal to $Y = B - L$. The fermion doublets are given by

$$\begin{aligned} &\text{quarks:} \quad Q_L(2,1,\frac{1}{3}), \quad Q_R(1,2,\frac{1}{3}) \ , \\ &\text{leptons:} \quad L_L(2,1,-1), \quad L_R(1,2,-1) \ . \end{aligned} \tag{2.2}$$

We also introduce four kinds of Higgs fields

$$\phi(2,2,0) \ , \quad \Delta_L(3,1,2) \ , \quad \Delta_R(1,3,2) \ , \quad \eta(1,1,0) \ , \tag{2.3}$$

with representations as

$$\begin{aligned} &\phi = \begin{pmatrix} \phi_1^0 & \phi_1^+ \\ \phi_2^- & \phi_2^0 \end{pmatrix} \ , \quad \tilde{\phi} = \begin{pmatrix} \bar{\phi}_2^0 & -\phi_2^+ \\ -\phi_1^- & \bar{\phi}_1^0 \end{pmatrix} \ , \\ &\Delta_L = \begin{pmatrix} \delta_L^+/\sqrt{2} & \delta_L^{++} \\ \delta_L^0 & -\delta_L^+/\sqrt{2} \end{pmatrix} \ , \quad \Delta_R = \begin{pmatrix} \delta_R^+/\sqrt{2} & \delta_R^{++} \\ \delta_R^0 & -\delta_R^+/\sqrt{2} \end{pmatrix} \ . \end{aligned} \tag{2.4}$$

We consider only leptonic parts :

$$L = L_F + L_Y + L_B \ . \tag{2.5}$$

with

$$L_F = i\bar{\psi}^j_L \gamma^\mu \Big(\partial_\mu - i\frac{1}{2} g_1 Y_F B_\mu - i g_L W^L_\mu\Big)\psi^j_L \qquad (2.6)$$
$$+ i\bar{\psi}^j_R \gamma^\mu \Big(\partial_\mu - i\frac{1}{2} g_1 Y_F B_\mu - i g_R W^R_\mu\Big)\psi^j_R \ , \quad W^{L,R}_\mu \equiv \frac{1}{2}\tau_\alpha W^\alpha_{\mu,L,R} \ ,$$

$$L_Y = -\bar{\psi}^i_L \Big(f_{ij}\phi + \tilde{f}_{ij}\tilde{\phi}\Big)\psi^j_R \ + \text{H. c.} \qquad (2.7)$$
$$- i\psi^{Ti}_L C h^L_{ij}\tau_2 \Delta_L \psi^j_L + \text{H. c.}$$
$$- i\psi^{Ti}_R C h^R_{ij}\tau_2 \Delta_R \psi^j_R + \text{H. c.} \ ,$$

$$L_B = tr|D_\mu \Delta_L|^2 + tr|D_\mu \Delta_R|^2 + tr|D_\mu \phi|^2 + \frac{1}{2}\partial_\mu \eta \partial^\mu \eta \qquad (2.8)$$
$$+ \text{Yang-Mills terms of } B_\mu, W^L_\mu, W^R_\mu$$
$$- V(\text{Higgs potential of } \phi, \Delta_L, \Delta_R, \eta) \ ,$$

$$\psi^i_L = \begin{pmatrix} \nu_i \\ e_i \end{pmatrix}_L \ , \quad \psi^i_R = \begin{pmatrix} \nu_i \\ e_i \end{pmatrix}_R \quad i = e, \mu, \tau, \qquad (2.9)$$
$$\tilde{\phi} = \tau_2 \phi^* \tau_2 \ .$$

The Dirac-Majorana type couplings are given in Eq.(2.7).

Under gauge transformations Higgs fields are transformed as

$$\phi \to U_L \phi U_R^{-1} \ , \quad \tilde{\phi} \to U_L \tilde{\phi} U_R^{-1} \ , \qquad (2.10)$$
$$\Delta_L \to U_L \Delta_L U_L^{-1} \ , \quad \Delta_R \to U_R \Delta_R U_R^{-1} \ ,$$

so that covariant derivatives are given by

$$D\phi = \partial\phi - i\big(g_L W_L \phi - g_R \phi W_R\big) \ , \qquad (2.11)$$
$$D\Delta_L = \partial\Delta_L - i\frac{1}{2} g_1 Y_\Delta B \Delta_L - i g_L (W_L \Delta_L - \Delta_L W_L) \ ,$$
$$D\Delta_R = \partial\Delta_R - i\frac{1}{2} g_1 Y_\Delta B \Delta_R - i g_R (W_R \Delta_R - \Delta_R W_R) \ ,$$

where $Y_\phi = 0, Y_\Delta = +2$ and $Y_F = -1$.

The gauge symmetry of $SU(2)_L \times SU(2)_R \times U(1)_{B-L} \times D$ is broken down until $U(1)_{em}$ by nonzero vacuum expectation values of Higgs fields

$$\langle\ \phi\ \rangle = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\begin{pmatrix} \kappa_1 & 0 \\ 0 & \kappa_2 \end{pmatrix} \ , \quad \langle\ \Delta_{L,R}\ \rangle = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ V_{L,R} & 0 \end{pmatrix} \ , \quad \langle\ \eta\ \rangle = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\eta_0 \ , \qquad (2.12)$$

with assumptions

$$\big|V_L\big| << \big|\kappa_{1,2}\big| << \big|V_R\big| << \big|\eta_0\big| \ . \qquad (2.13)$$

The Yukawa terms then become

$$- L_Y = \bar{\psi}^i_L \Big(f_{ij}\left\langle\phi\right\rangle + \tilde{f}_{ij}\left\langle\tilde{\phi}\right\rangle\Big)\psi^j_R \ + \text{H. c.} \qquad (2.14)$$
$$+ i\psi^{Ti}_L C\tau_2 h^L_{ij}\left\langle\Delta_L\right\rangle \psi^j_L + \text{H. c.}$$
$$+ i\psi^{Ti}_R C\tau_2 h^R_{ij}\left\langle\Delta_R\right\rangle \psi^j_R + \text{H. c.}$$
$$= \bar{\nu}^i_L m_{Dij}\nu^j_R + \frac{1}{2}\bar{\nu}^{iC}_R m_{Lij}\nu^j_L + \frac{1}{2}\bar{\nu}^{iC}_L m_{Rij}\nu^j_R + \bar{e}^i_L m'_{Dij} e^j_R + \text{H. c.} \ .$$

Here we have used notations

$$\bar{\psi}_L^C = \big(\frac{1-\gamma_5}{2}\psi^C\big)^\dagger\gamma^0 = \psi_R^T C\ , \quad \bar{\psi}_R^C = \psi_L^T C\ , \tag{2.15}$$

and

$$m_{Dij} = \frac{f_{ij}\kappa_1 + \tilde{f}_{ij}\kappa_2}{\sqrt{2}} \simeq m_l\ , \quad m_{Rij} = \sqrt{2}V_R h_{ij}^R\ , \quad m_{Lij} = \sqrt{2}V_L h_{ij}^L\ , \tag{2.16}$$
$$m'_{Dij} = \frac{f_{ij}\kappa_2 + \tilde{f}_{ij}\kappa_1}{\sqrt{2}} \simeq m_l\ .$$

In order to make mass terms real, any parameter here is taken to be real. We assume that m_D and m'_D take values of the order of leptonic masses m_l, i.e., $m_D \simeq m'_D \simeq m_l$.

According to Eq.(2.13) we have inequalities

$$\big|m_{Lij}\big| << \big|m_{Dij}\big| << \big|m_{Rij}\big|\ . \tag{2.17}$$

The neutrino terms can be written as

$$\left(\ \bar{\nu}\ \ \bar{N}\ \right)\begin{pmatrix} m_L & m_D \\ m_D & m_R \end{pmatrix}\begin{pmatrix} \nu \\ N \end{pmatrix} = \bar{\nu}m_L\nu + \bar{\nu}m_D N + \bar{N}m_D\nu + \bar{N}m_R N\ , \tag{2.18}$$

where

$$\nu = \frac{\nu_L + (\nu_L)^C}{\sqrt{2}} = \frac{\nu_L + \nu_R^C}{\sqrt{2}}\ , \tag{2.19}$$
$$N = \frac{\nu_R + (\nu_R)^C}{\sqrt{2}} = \frac{\nu_R + \nu_L^C}{\sqrt{2}}\ . \tag{2.20}$$

Making the mass matrix diagonal we have the seesaw result for each ij

$$\big|m_{aij}\big| \simeq \big|\frac{(m_{Dij})^2}{m_{Rij}}\big|\ , \tag{2.21}$$
$$\big|m_b\big| \simeq \big|m_{Rij}\big|\ , \tag{2.22}$$

with eigenstates

$$\mid \nu_{aj}\ \rangle \simeq \mid \nu_j\ \rangle - \frac{m_{Dij}}{m_{Rij}}\mid N_j\ \rangle\ , \tag{2.23}$$
$$\mid N_{bj}\ \rangle \simeq \mid N_j\ \rangle + \frac{m_{Dij}}{m_{Rij}}\mid \nu_j\ \rangle\ . \tag{2.24}$$

Finally Eq.(2.18) turns out to be

$$\bar{\nu}_{ai}m_{aij}\nu_{aj} + \bar{N}_{bj}m_{bij}N_{bj}\ . \tag{2.25}$$

Each term should be diagonal for three generations, $i, j = 1, 2, 3$.

The ν is made of ν_L, while N is made of ν_R, as is seen from Eqs.(2.19) and(2.20). The mass of ν is so small, whereas that of N is too heavy to observe, according to the seesaw mechanism. This is the reason why ν_L only is observable but not ν_R. The heavy particle ν_R together with W' and Z' is now widely recognized as one of strong candidates for dark matters.

III. THE T MATRIX

Let us introduce new variables (A_μ, Z_μ, Z'_μ), which are mass eigenstates of three gauge fields $(B_\mu, W^3_{L\mu}, W^3_{R\mu})$, by

$$\begin{pmatrix} B \\ W^3_L \\ W^3_R \end{pmatrix} = T \begin{pmatrix} A \\ Z \\ Z' \end{pmatrix} , \tag{3.1}$$

where T is a 3×3 unitary matrix. Then we have

$$\begin{aligned} B &= T_{11}A + T_{12}Z + T_{13}Z' , \\ W^3_L &= T_{21}A + T_{22}Z + T_{23}Z' , \\ W^3_R &= T_{31}A + T_{32}Z + T_{33}Z' . \end{aligned} \tag{3.2}$$

From gauge coupling terms in Lagrangian (2.6) a collection of coefficients of $A_\mu(x)$ suggest us that the electric charge $-e_0$ of the electron is given by, as shown in Appendix,

$$\begin{aligned} e_0 &= \frac{1}{2}(g_1 T_{11} + g_L T_{21}) , \\ g_1 T_{11} &= g_L T_{21} = g_R T_{31} = e_0 . \end{aligned} \tag{3.3}$$

Here we have the desired electromagnetic coupling term $e_0 A\bar{e}\gamma e$.

The T matrix is generally given by three mixing angles

$$T = \begin{pmatrix} c_{12} & -s_{12} & 0 \\ s_{12} & c_{12} & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} c_{13} & 0 & -s_{13} \\ 0 & 1 & 0 \\ s_{13} & 0 & c_{13} \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & c_{23} & -s_{23} \\ 0 & s_{23} & c_{23} \end{pmatrix} \tag{3.4}$$

$$= \begin{pmatrix} c_{12}c_{13} & -s_{12}c_{23} - c_{12}s_{23}s_{13} & s_{12}s_{23} - c_{12}c_{23}s_{13} \\ s_{12}c_{13} & c_{12}c_{23} - s_{12}s_{23}s_{13} & -c_{12}s_{23} - s_{12}c_{23}s_{13} \\ s_{13} & s_{23}c_{13} & c_{23}c_{13} \end{pmatrix} , \tag{3.5}$$

where $c_{ij} = \cos\theta_{ij}, s_{ij} = \sin\theta_{ij}$, and sometimes we use a notation $\theta_{12} = \theta$ for simplicity. From constraints (3.3) we have

$$\begin{aligned} g_1 T_{11} &= g_1 c_{12} c_{13} = e_0 , \\ g_L T_{21} &= g_L s_{12} c_{13} = e_0 , \\ g_R T_{31} &= g_R s_{13} = e_0 , \end{aligned} \tag{3.6}$$

so that

$$\begin{aligned} &\tan\theta_{12} = \frac{g_1}{g_L} , \\ &\sin\theta_{13} = \frac{e_0}{g_R} , \\ &\frac{1}{e_o^2} = \frac{1}{g_1^2} + \frac{1}{g_L^2} + \frac{1}{g_R^2} , \\ &g_1\cos\theta = \frac{e_o}{c_{13}} , \quad g_L \sin\theta = \frac{e_o}{c_{13}} , \quad \theta = \theta_{12} . \end{aligned} \tag{3.7}$$

IV. MASSES OF CHARGED GAUGE BOSONS

The aim of this section is to calculate the numerical values of δ and V_R, which are defined in Eq.(4.15). In order to do this, we follow the work of Ref.[13].

After the gauge symmetry is spontaneously broken, the trace parts in Eq.(2.8) are summarized as follows:

$$\begin{aligned}
&tr|D\Delta_L|^2 = \frac{1}{2}\left[|g_L W_L^+|^2 + (g_1 B - g_L W_L^3)^2\right] V_L^2 \ , \qquad (4.1)\\
&tr|D\Delta_L|^2 = \frac{1}{2}\left[|g_R W_R^+|^2 + (g_1 B - g_R W_R^3)^2\right] V_R^2 \ ,\\
&tr|D\phi|^2 = \frac{1}{8}\left[(g_L W_L^3 - g_R W_R^3)^2(\kappa_1^2+\kappa_2^2) + 2|\kappa_1 g_L W_L^+ - \kappa_2 g_R W_R^+|^2 + 2|\kappa_2 g_L W_L^+ - \kappa_1 g_R W_R^+|^2\right] \ ,\\
&W_{L,R}^\pm = (W^1 \mp iW^2)_{L,R}/\sqrt{2} \ .
\end{aligned}$$

The charged boson mass terms are then given by

$$\begin{aligned}
X \equiv\ & \frac{1}{2}|g_L W_L^+|^2 V_L^2 + \frac{1}{2}|g_R W_R^+|^2 V_R^2 \qquad (4.2)\\
& + \frac{1}{4}|\kappa_1 g_L W_L^+ - \kappa_2 g_R W_R^+|^2 + \frac{1}{4}|\kappa_2 g_L W_L^+ - \kappa_1 g_R W_R^+|^2\\
& = \frac{1}{2}|W_L^+|^2\left[g_L^2 V_L^2 + \frac{1}{2}(\kappa_1^2+\kappa_2^2)g_L^2\right] + \frac{1}{2}|W_R^+|^2\left[g_R^2 V_R^2 + \frac{1}{2}(\kappa_1^2+\kappa_2^2)g_R^2\right]\\
& - \frac{1}{2}\kappa_1\kappa_2 g_L g_R (W_L^+ W_R^- + W_R^+ W_L^-) \ .
\end{aligned}$$

Let us introduce here new variables as mass eigenstates by

$$\begin{pmatrix} W_L^\pm \\ W_R^\pm \end{pmatrix} = U \begin{pmatrix} W^\pm \\ W'^\pm \end{pmatrix} \ , \quad U = \begin{pmatrix} \cos\gamma & \sin\gamma \\ -\sin\gamma & \cos\gamma \end{pmatrix} \ . \qquad (4.3)$$

Eq.(4.2) turns out to be of the form

$$X = |W|^2 M_W^2 + |W'|^2 M_{W'}^2 + (W^\dagger W' + W'^\dagger W)\lambda, \qquad (4.4)$$

where

$$\begin{aligned}
M_W^2 &= G_L U_{11}^2 + G_R U_{21}^2 - \kappa_1\kappa_2 g_L g_R U_{11} U_{21} \ , \qquad (4.5)\\
M_{W'}^2 &= G_L U_{12}^2 + G_R U_{22}^2 - \kappa_1\kappa_2 g_L g_R U_{12} U_{22} \ , \qquad (4.6)\\
\lambda &= U_{11}U_{12}G_L + U_{21}U_{22}G_R - \frac{1}{2}\kappa_1\kappa_2 g_L g_R (U_{12}U_{21} + U_{22}U_{11}) \ , \qquad (4.7)
\end{aligned}$$

with

$$G_L = \frac{1}{2}g_L^2\left[V_L^2 + \frac{1}{2}(\kappa_1^2+\kappa_2^2)\right] \ , \quad G_R = \frac{1}{2}g_R^2\left[V_R^2 + \frac{1}{2}(\kappa_1^2+\kappa_2^2)\right] \ . \qquad (4.8)$$

The vanishing condition of the cross term is given by

$$\lambda = 0 \ , \qquad (4.9)$$

$$\text{i.e.} \quad \tan 2\gamma = \frac{\kappa_1\kappa_2 g_L g_R}{G_L - G_R} \simeq -\frac{2\kappa_1\kappa_2}{V_R^2}\varepsilon = 2\gamma \qquad (4.10)$$

hence

$$\left|\frac{\gamma}{\varepsilon}\right| = \left|\frac{\kappa_1\kappa_2}{V_R^2}\right| << 1 \ , \tag{4.11}$$

where $\varepsilon = g_L/g_R$. We see that the mixing angle γ is very small.

Finally we find the charged boson masses

$$M_W^2 = g_L^2\frac{\kappa_1^2+\kappa_2^2}{4} + \frac{1}{2}g_L^2\kappa_1\kappa_2\big(\frac{\gamma}{\varepsilon}\big) \simeq g_L^2\frac{\kappa_1^2+\kappa_2^2}{4} \ , \tag{4.12}$$

$$M_{W'}^2 = \frac{1}{2}g_R^2V_R^2 - g_L^2\kappa_1\kappa_2\big(\frac{\gamma}{\varepsilon}\big) \simeq \frac{1}{2}g_R^2V_R^2 \ , \tag{4.13}$$

Substituting V_R^2 and g_L^2 into Eq.(4.10), the mixing angle can be written as

$$\tan 2\gamma = -\frac{4\kappa_1\kappa_2}{\kappa_1^2+\kappa_2^2}\frac{g_R}{g_L}\Big(\frac{M_W}{M_{W'}}\Big)^2 \ . \tag{4.14}$$

Also the mass ratios of W and W' are given by

$$\Big(\frac{M_W}{M_{W'}}\Big)^2 = 2\Big(\frac{g_L}{g_R}\Big)^2\frac{\kappa_1^2+\kappa_2^2}{4V_R^2} = 2\varepsilon^2\delta \ , \quad \delta \equiv \frac{\kappa_1^2+\kappa_2^2}{4V_R^2} \ . \tag{4.15}$$

These formulas are completely identical with results of Ref.[13].

If we take values of Deppisch et al. [4], $g_L = 0.63, g_R = 0.38$, and the recent LHC data of $M_{W'} =$ 1900 GeV[16], together with $M_W = 80$ GeV, then we have $\delta = 3.2 \times 10^{-4}$. Furthermore, we get the vacuum expectation value $V_R = 7.1 \times 10^3$ GeV from Eq.(4.13). If we take values of Dev et al. [6], $g_L = 0.63, g_R = 0.51$, then we have $\delta = 5.8 \times 10^{-4}$ and $V_R = 5.3 \times 10^3$ GeV. Finally we get $V_\phi = \sqrt{(\kappa_1^2+\kappa_2^2)/4}$ ~127 GeV from $M_W = g_LV_\phi$.

V. MASSES OF NEUTRAL GAUGE BOSONS

The aim of this section is to find constraint equations Eq.(5.11) among mixing angles, which allow us to introduce a new mixing angle in Sec.VI.

From Eq.(4.1) the mass terms of neutral gauge boson are collected as

$$X' \equiv \frac{1}{2}\big[(g_1B - g_LW_L^3)^2V_L^2 + (g_1B - g_RW_R^3)^2V_R^2\big] + \frac{1}{8}\big[(g_LW_L^3 - g_RW_R^3)^2(\kappa_1^2+\kappa_2^2)\big] \ , \tag{5.1}$$

where

$$g_1B - g_LW_L^3 = Z(g_1T_{12} - g_LT_{22}) + Z'(g_1T_{13} - g_LT_{23}) \ , \tag{5.2}$$

$$g_1B - g_RW_R^3 = Z(g_1T_{12} - g_RT_{32}) + Z'(g_1T_{13} - g_RT_{33}) \ , \tag{5.3}$$

$$g_LW_L^3 - g_RW_R^3 = Z(g_LT_{22} - g_RT_{32}) + Z'(g_LT_{23} - g_RT_{33}) \ . \tag{5.4}$$

Substituting Eqs.(5.2)-(5.4) into Eq.(5.1) we get

$$X' = \frac{1}{2}Z^2M_Z^2 + \frac{1}{2}Z'^2M_{Z'}^2 + \mu ZZ' \ , \tag{5.5}$$

where

$$M_Z^2 = (g_1 T_{12} - g_L T_{22})^2 V_L^2 + (g_1 T_{12} - g_R T_{32})^2 V_R^2 + \frac{\kappa_1^2 + \kappa_2^2}{4} (g_L T_{22} - g_R T_{32})^2 \ , \tag{5.6}$$

$$M_{Z'}^2 = (g_1 T_{13} - g_L T_{23})^2 V_L^2 + (g_1 T_{13} - g_R T_{33})^2 V_R^2 + \frac{\kappa_1^2 + \kappa_2^2}{4} (g_L T_{23} - g_R T_{33})^2 \ , \tag{5.7}$$

$$\begin{aligned} \mu = {} & (g_1 T_{12} - g_L T_{22})(g_1 T_{13} - g_L T_{23}) V_L^2 + (g_1 T_{12} - g_R T_{32})(g_1 T_{13} - g_R T_{33}) V_R^2 \\ & + \frac{\kappa_1^2 + \kappa_2^2}{4} (g_L T_{22} - g_R T_{32})(g_L T_{23} - g_R T_{33}) \ . \end{aligned} \tag{5.8}$$

The vanishing condition of the cross term is given by

$$\mu = 0 \ . \tag{5.9}$$

If we put $V_L = 0$, then Eq.(5.9) turns out to be

$$(g_1 s c_{23} + l s_{23})(g_1 s s_{23} - l c_{23}) = \delta (g_L c c_{23} - l s_{23})(-g_L c s_{23} - l c_{23}) \ , \tag{5.10}$$

where

$$\delta \equiv \frac{\kappa_1^2 + \kappa_2^2}{4 V_R^2} << 1 \ , \quad l \equiv \sqrt{g_R^2 + g_1^2 c^2} \ .$$

Solutions to θ_{23} are

$$\tan\theta_{23} = \frac{l}{g_1 s} + O(\delta) \ , \quad -\frac{g_1 s}{l} + O(\delta) \ . \tag{5.11}$$

The Z boson mass is then given by Eq. (5.6), which reduces to

$$M_Z^2 = V_R^2 (g_1 s c_{23} + l s_{23})^2 + \frac{\kappa_1^2 + \kappa_2^2}{4} (g_L c c_{23} - l s_{23})^2 = \frac{\kappa_1^2 + \kappa_2^2}{4} (g_L^2 + g_1^2) c_{23}^2 \ , \tag{5.12}$$

This final form can be seen as follows: Substituting the second solution of Eq.(5.11) into the second bracket with V_R^2 in Eq.(5.6), we get

$$V_R^2 (g_1 s c_{23} + l s_{23})^2 = V_R^2 c_{23}^2 (g_1 s + l \tan\theta_{23})^2 = V_R^2 c_{23}^2 l^2 \times O(\delta^2) \sim \frac{1}{V_R^2} \ . \tag{5.13}$$

The third bracket term becomes

$$g_L c c_{23} - l s_{23} = c_{23}(g_L c - l \tan\theta_{23}) = c_{23}(g_L c + g_1 s - O(l\delta)) = c_{23} \sqrt{g_L^2 + g_1^2} - O(l c_{23} \delta) \ . \tag{5.14}$$

Neglecting $O(\delta)$ term we get the final result of Eq. (5.12).

The first solution in Eq.(5.11) is inadequate for M_Z, because it gives a big mass of order V_R^2.

In the same way we have

$$M_{Z'}^2 = c_{23}^2 \big(l + \frac{g_1 s^2}{l}\big)^2 V_R^2 + \frac{\kappa_1^2 + \kappa_2^2}{4} c_{23}^2 (l - \frac{g_L g_1 s c}{l})^2 \ , \tag{5.15}$$

or

$$M_{Z'} \simeq l c_{23} \big(1 + \frac{g_1 s^2}{l^2}\big) V_R = g_R V_R \frac{1}{c_{23} c_{13}} \ . \tag{5.16}$$

VI. MIXING ANGLES

In this section we consider what kinds of mixing angles are observable. At first we derive a relation

$$\frac{M_Z}{M_W}=\frac{\sqrt{g_1^2+g_L^2}}{g_L}c_{23}=\frac{\cos\theta_{23}}{\cos\theta}\ , \tag{6.1}$$

which follows from Eqs. (4.12) and (5.12). From Eq.(3.7) and $l=\sqrt{g_R^2+g_1^2c^2}$, we see

$$\frac{g_1c}{l}=s_{13}\ . \tag{6.2}$$

Hence Eq.(5.11) can be written as

$$\tan\theta_{23}=-\frac{g_1s}{l}+O(\delta)=-\frac{ss_{13}}{c}+O(\delta)\ , \tag{6.3}$$

This can be rewritten as

$$\frac{c^2}{c_{23}^2}=1-s^2c_{13}^2+O(\delta)\ . \tag{6.4}$$

In $\delta\sim 0$, then introducing new variables by

$$sc_{13}=s'\ ,\quad \frac{c}{c_{23}}=c' \tag{6.5}$$

we see from Eq. (6.4)

$$c'^2+s'^2=1\ , \tag{6.6}$$

Hence one can set s',c' as $s'=\sin\theta', c'=\cos\theta'$, respectively. Equation (6.1) is now simply given by

$$\frac{M_Z}{M_W}=\frac{1}{c'} \tag{6.7}$$

Another useful relation is obtained from the low-energy νe scattering amplitude with the W boson exchange. This is given by, from (A2),

$$\left(\frac{g_L}{2\sqrt{2}}\cos\gamma\right)^2\frac{1}{M_W^2}=\frac{G}{\sqrt{2}}\ , \tag{6.8}$$

where G is the Fermi constant, and γ is the mixing angle between W_L and W_R.
One can put $\cos\gamma\simeq 1$, since γ is very small. Substituting $g_L=e_0/(sc_{13})=e_0/s'$ into Eq.(6.8) , we have

$$M_W=37.3\frac{1}{s'}\ \text{GeV}\ . \tag{6.9}$$

The coupling strength $g_{\nu Z}$ between ν and Z can be seen from (A2) to be

$$\bar\nu_L\gamma x_L\nu_L=g_{\nu Z}\bar\nu_L\gamma\nu_L Z\ , \tag{6.10}$$

where

$$g_{\nu Z}=\frac{1}{2}(-g_1T_{12}+g_LT_{22})=\frac{e_0}{2c's'}\ . \tag{6.11}$$

The coupling strength between the electron and Z is also calculated from (A2) as follows:

$$\begin{aligned}&\bar{e}_L\gamma y_L e_L + \bar{e}_R\gamma y_R e_R \\ &= \bar{e}_L\gamma e_L Z\frac{1}{2}(g_1T_{12} + g_LT_{22}) + \bar{e}_R\gamma e_R Z\frac{1}{2}(g_1T_{12} + g_RT_{32}) \\ &= (\alpha_L\bar{e}_L\gamma e_L + \alpha_R\bar{e}_R\gamma e_R)Z \ ,\end{aligned} \tag{6.12}$$

with

$$\begin{aligned}\alpha_L &= \frac{e_0}{2c's'}(c'^2 - s'^2) \ , \\ \alpha_R &= -\frac{e_0 s'}{c'} \ ,\end{aligned} \tag{6.13}$$

where use has been made of Eq.(6.3), i. e., $\tan\theta_{23} = -ss_{13}/c$.
Hence the eZ coupling strengths $\alpha_{L,R}$ are also a function of c' and s'. The same formula as $\alpha_{L,R}$ can be shown to hold for coupling strengths between the proton and Z (see the Appendix).

As far as light particles such as $W^\pm, Z, \nu_L$ and charged leptons (quarks) are concerned, all results are completely the same as those of the Weinberg-Salam theory with $SU(2)_L \times U(1)_Y$ in $\delta \sim 0$ if we take $s' = \sin\theta_W, c' = \cos\theta_W$, where θ_W is the Weinberg angle. Here WS gauge coupling constants g and g' are given by

$$\begin{aligned}g' &\equiv g_1c_{13}c_{23} = \frac{e_0}{c}c_{23} = \frac{e_0}{c'} = \frac{e_0}{\cos\theta_W} = \frac{e_0}{0.88} = 0.34 \ , \\ g &= \frac{e_0}{\sin\theta_W} = \frac{e_0}{sc_{13}} = g_L = \frac{e_0}{0.48} = 0.63 \ ,\end{aligned} \tag{6.14}$$

respectively, around mass scales of weak gauge bosons M_W, M_Z. Both equations $g = g_L$ and $g' = g_1c_{13}c_{23}$ are our new results together with $\theta' = \theta_W$.

Here we can show that any mixing angle is expressed in terms of θ_W and $\varepsilon \equiv g_L/g_R$. At first we have

$$\varepsilon = \frac{g_L}{g_R} = \frac{s_{13}}{sc_{13}} = \frac{s_{13}}{s'} = \frac{s_{13}}{s_W} \ , \tag{6.15}$$

so that

$$s_{13} = \varepsilon s_W \ . \tag{6.16}$$

Secondary, from Eq.(6.15) we get

$$\varepsilon^2 = \frac{1}{s_W^2} - \frac{1}{s^2} \ , \tag{6.17}$$

to follow

$$s = s_{12} = \frac{s_W}{\sqrt{1 - \varepsilon^2 s_W^2}} \ . \tag{6.18}$$

Third, from the definition (6.5) we have

$$c_{23}^2 = \frac{c^2}{c'^2} = \frac{1 - s^2}{c'^2} \ . \tag{6.19}$$

Substituting Eq.(6.18) into the above, we get

$$c_{23} = \sqrt{\frac{1 - \varepsilon^2\tan^2\theta_W}{1 - \varepsilon^2\sin^2\theta_W}} \ . \tag{6.20}$$

To sum up we have

$$\begin{aligned}
&\theta' = \theta_W \ , \quad \varepsilon = \frac{g_L}{g_R} \ , \\
&\theta_{12} = \sin^{-1}\Big(\frac{\sin\theta_W}{\sqrt{1-\varepsilon^2\sin^2\theta_W}}\Big) \ , \\
&\theta_{13} = \sin^{-1}\big(\varepsilon\sin\theta_W\big) \ , \\
&\theta_{23} = \cos^{-1}\sqrt{\frac{1-\varepsilon^2\tan^2\theta_W}{1-\varepsilon^2\sin^2\theta_W}}
\end{aligned} \tag{6.21}$$

Finally let us discuss about the ratio of gauge coupling strengths $\varepsilon = g_L/g_R$. From Eq.(6.17) we see that it cannot be fixed by θ_W only. However, the s can be expressed in terms of a mass ratio for heavy gauge bosons

$$\frac{M_{W'}}{M_{Z'}} = \frac{c_{13}c_{23}}{\sqrt{2}} \ , \tag{6.22}$$

which comes from Eqs.(5.16) and (4.13). By definitions (6.5) we have

$$c_{13}c_{23} = \frac{s'c}{sc'} = \frac{\tan\theta'}{\tan\theta} \ , \tag{6.23}$$

so that

$$\varepsilon^2 = \frac{1}{s'^2} - \frac{1}{s^2} = \cot^2\theta' - \cot^2\theta = \cot^2\theta'\Big[1 - 2\frac{M_{W'}^2}{M_{Z'}^2}\Big] \ . \tag{6.24}$$

Hence we get

$$\frac{M_{W'}^2}{M_{Z'}^2} = \frac{1}{2}\big(1 - \varepsilon^2\tan^2\theta'\big) \ . \tag{6.25}$$

We know the experimental value of θ' to be $\cot\theta' = 1.83$ ($\sin^2\theta' = 0.23$). Then, Duka et al.[3] worked with $\epsilon = 1$ to obtain $x = M_{W'}/M_{Z'} = 0.59$. Deppisch et al.[4] found the pair $(x, \varepsilon) = (0.30, 1.66)$ based on the $SO(10)$ unified model, and Dev et al.[6] found $(x, \varepsilon) = (0.63, 1.23)$. On the other hand Patra et al.[5] worked in a region $M_{W'} > M_{Z'}$, by considering another model where Eq.(6.25) does not hold.

VII. CONCLUDING REMARKS

Our new results are summarized as follows:

1. The mass matrix for neutral gauge bosons becomes diagonal if

$$\tan\theta_{23} = -\frac{s_{12}s_{13}}{c_{12}} + O(\delta) \ , \quad \delta = \frac{\kappa_1^2+\kappa_2^2}{4V_R^2} = 5.8\times10^{-4} << 1$$

Under this constraint we have defined uniquely a new mixing angle θ' by

$$s' = sc_{13} \ , \quad c' = \frac{c}{c_{23}}, \quad s'^2 + c'^2 = 1 \ .$$

Then the light gauge boson world is described by θ' only as below

$$
\begin{aligned}
M_W &= \frac{37.3}{s'} \text{ GeV} , \\
\frac{M_Z}{M_W} &= \frac{1}{c'} , \\
g_{\nu Z} &= -\frac{e_0}{2c's'} , \\
g(pZ)_L &= \frac{e_0(c'^2 - s'^2)}{2s'c'} , \quad g(pZ)_R = -\frac{e_0 s'}{c'} ,
\end{aligned}
$$

All results are completely the same as those of the Weinberg-Salam theory with $SU(2)_L \times U(1)_Y$, if we take $s' \equiv \sin\theta_W$, $c' = \cos\theta_W$ where θ_W is the Weinberg angle.
The WS gauge coupling constants g and g' are given by

$$
\begin{aligned}
g' &\equiv g_1 c_{13} c_{23} = \frac{e_0}{c_{12}} c_{23} = \frac{e_0}{c'} = \frac{e_0}{\cos\theta_W} = 0.34 , \\
g &= \frac{e_0}{\sin\theta_W} = \frac{e_0}{s c_{13}} = g_L = \frac{e_0}{0.48} = 0.63 ,
\end{aligned}
$$

2. Any mixing angle is expressed in terms of θ_W and $\varepsilon = g_L/g_R$ as below

$$
\begin{aligned}
\theta' &= \theta_W , \\
\theta_{12} &= \sin^{-1}\Big(\frac{\sin\theta_W}{\sqrt{1-\varepsilon^2 \sin^2\theta_W}}\Big) , \\
\theta_{13} &= \sin^{-1}\big(\varepsilon \sin\theta_W\big) , \\
\theta_{23} &= \cos^{-1}\sqrt{\frac{1-\varepsilon^2\tan^2\theta_W}{1-\varepsilon^2\sin^2\theta_W}}
\end{aligned}
$$

3. We have given the mass formula for heavy gauge bosons

$$
\frac{M^2_{W'}}{M^2_{Z'}} = \frac{1}{2}\big(1 - \varepsilon^2 \tan^2\theta'\big) .
$$

A similar formula like this has been so far derived by many authors in different ways from ours. Here we have given its exact proof based on our formula $\tan\theta' = s_{12}s_{13}c_{23}/c_{12}$.

4. Mass formulas (5.12) and (5.16) for M_Z and $M_{Z'}$ are new forms expressed in terms of mixing angles.

5. Our general observations are that the world of light gauge bosons is described by θ' only, whereas the world of heavy gauge bosons is described by two parameters ε and θ', together with V_R. The first notice of the Z' mass can be seen in Ref. [14] with the $\varepsilon = 1$ model, and in Ref.[15] with the extra $U(1)$ model.

The LRSM can be constructed from the geometric point of view of the gauge theory in $M_4 \times Z_2 \times Z_2$, where M_4 is the four-dimensional Minkowski space and $Z_2 \times Z_2$ is the discrete space with four points[17]. The three Higgs fields ϕ, Δ_L and Δ_R can be regarded as gauge fields in $Z_2 \times Z_2$. The Higgs potential, therefore, should be of the Yang-Mills type, which contains eleven free parameters. This should be compared with the general Higgs potential [18], which contains eighteen parameters.

Acknowledgments

We would like to express our deep gratitude to T. Okamura for many valuable discussions.

Appendix A: Electromagnetic couplings with fermions and the proton-Z coupling strengths

The fermionic Lagrangian with gauge couplings is given by

$$\begin{aligned} L_F &= i\bar{\psi}_L\gamma^\mu\Big(\partial_\mu - i\frac{1}{2}g_1 Y_F B_\mu - i\frac{1}{2}g_L\tau_\alpha W^\alpha_{\mu\ L}\Big)\psi_L \\ &\quad + i\bar{\psi}_R\gamma^\mu\Big(\partial_\mu - i\frac{1}{2}g_1 Y_F B_\mu - i\frac{1}{2}g_R\tau_\alpha W^\alpha_{\mu\ R}\Big)\psi_R\ , \quad \psi = \begin{pmatrix} u \\ d \end{pmatrix}\ , \begin{pmatrix} \nu \\ e \end{pmatrix}\ , \begin{pmatrix} p \\ n \end{pmatrix}\ , \cdots \end{aligned} \tag{A1}$$

Gauge coupling terms X are included in the form for the lepton case

$$\begin{aligned} X &= \bar{\nu}_L\gamma x_L\nu_L + \bar{e}_L\gamma y_L e_L + \frac{g_L}{\sqrt{2}}\bar{\nu}_L\gamma W^+_L e_L + \frac{g_L}{\sqrt{2}}\bar{e}_L\gamma W^-_L\nu_L \\ &\quad + \bar{\nu}_R\gamma x_R\nu_R + \bar{e}_R\gamma y_R e_R + \frac{g_R}{\sqrt{2}}\bar{\nu}_R\gamma W^+_R e_R + \frac{g_R}{\sqrt{2}}\bar{e}_R\gamma W^-_R\nu_R\ , \end{aligned} \tag{A2}$$

where $W^\pm_{L,R} = (W^1 \mp iW^2)_{L,R}/\sqrt{2}$, and

$$\begin{aligned} x_L &= \frac{1}{2}(g_1Y_FB + g_LW^3_L) = \frac{1}{2}g_1Y_F(T_{11}A + T_{12}Z + T_{13}Z') + \frac{1}{2}g_L(T_{21}A + T_{22}Z + T_{23}Z') \\ &= \frac{1}{2}A(g_1Y_FT_{11} + g_LT_{21}) + \frac{1}{2}Z(g_1Y_FT_{12} + g_LT_{22}) + \frac{1}{2}Z'(g_1Y_FT_{13} + g_LT_{23})\ , \end{aligned} \tag{A3}$$

$$\begin{aligned} y_L &= \frac{1}{2}(g_1Y_FB - g_LW^3_L) = \frac{1}{2}g_1Y_F(T_{11}A + T_{12}Z + T_{13}Z') - \frac{1}{2}g_L(T_{21}A + T_{22}Z + T_{23}Z') \\ &= \frac{1}{2}A(g_1Y_FT_{11} - g_LT_{21}) + \frac{1}{2}Z(g_1Y_FT_{12} - g_LT_{22}) + \frac{1}{2}Z'(g_1Y_FT_{13} - g_LT_{23})\ , \end{aligned} \tag{A4}$$

$$\begin{aligned} x_R &= \frac{1}{2}(g_1Y_FB + g_RW^3_R) = \frac{1}{2}g_1Y_F(T_{11}A + T_{12}Z + T_{13}Z') + \frac{1}{2}g_L(T_{31}A + T_{32}Z + T_{33}Z') \\ &= \frac{1}{2}A(g_1Y_FT_{11} + g_RT_{31}) + \frac{1}{2}Z(g_1Y_FT_{12} + g_RT_{32}) + \frac{1}{2}Z'(g_1Y_FT_{13} + g_RT_{33})\ , \end{aligned} \tag{A5}$$

$$\begin{aligned} y_R &= \frac{1}{2}(g_1Y_FB - g_RW^3_R) = \frac{1}{2}g_1Y_F(T_{11}A + T_{12}Z + T_{13}Z') - \frac{1}{2}g_L(T_{31}A + T_{32}Z + T_{33}Z') \\ &= \frac{1}{2}A(g_1Y_FT_{11} - g_RT_{31}) + \frac{1}{2}Z(g_1Y_FT_{12} - g_RT_{32}) + \frac{1}{2}Z'(g_1Y_FT_{13} - g_RT_{33})\ , \end{aligned} \tag{A6}$$

with $Y_F = -1$. Collecting the electromagnetic terms and substituting them into (A2), we have constraint equations

$$\frac{1}{2}(g_1Y_FT_{11} + g_LT_{21}) = \frac{1}{2}(g_1Y_FT_{11} + g_RT_{31}) = 0\ , \tag{A7}$$

$$\frac{1}{2}(g_1Y_FT_{11} - g_LT_{21}) = \frac{1}{2}(g_1Y_FT_{11} - g_RT_{31}) = -e_0\ , \tag{A8}$$

Since the lepton takes $Y_F = -1$, we get

$$g_1T_{11} = g_LT_{21} = g_RT_{31} = e_0\ . \tag{A9}$$

The coupling strength between the proton and the Z boson can be calculated in such a way that $\psi = (p\ n)_{L,R}$ are $SU(2)_L \times SU(2)_R$ doublets with $Y_F = +1$. Neutral gauge coupling terms X are now included in

$$X = \bar{p}_L \gamma x_L p_L + \bar{p}_R \gamma x_R p_R \ , \tag{A10}$$

where

$$x_L = Z\frac{1}{2}(g_1 T_{12} + g_L T_{22}) = Z\frac{e_0}{2c's'}(c'^2 - s'^2) \equiv Z\alpha_L \ , \tag{A11}$$

is the same calculation as Eq. (6.10), while the second part goes as follows:

$$\begin{aligned} x_R &= Z\frac{1}{2}(g_1 T_{12} + g_R T_{32}) = Z\frac{e_0}{2}\Big(\frac{1}{cc_{13}}(-sc_{13} - cs_{13}s_{23}) + \frac{1}{s_{13}}s_{23}c_{13}\Big) \\ &= Z\frac{e_0 c_{23}}{2}\Big[-\frac{s}{cc_{13}} + \Big(\frac{c_{13}}{s_{13}} - \frac{s_{13}}{c_{13}}\Big)\tan\theta_{23}\Big] \ . \end{aligned} \tag{A12}$$

Substituting $\tan\theta_{23} = -ss_{13}/c$ into above, we have

$$x_R = Z\frac{e_0 c_{23}}{2}\Big[-\frac{s}{cc_{13}} - \Big(\frac{c_{13}}{s_{13}} - \frac{s_{13}}{c_{13}}\Big)\frac{ss_{13}}{c}\Big] = -Ze_0\frac{s'}{c'} \equiv Z\alpha_R \ , \tag{A13}$$

To sum up, neutral current strengths between the proton and the Z boson are given by

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_L &= \frac{e_0}{2c's'}(c'^2 - s'^2) \ , \\ \alpha_R &= -e_0\frac{s'}{c'} \end{aligned} \tag{A14}$$

These are completely the same forms as Eq.(6.13) for the electron and Z.

[1] Y. Totsuka, The 1997 International Symposium on Lepton and Photon Interactions at High Energies, Hamburg, 1997; Y. Fukuda et al. (Super-Kamiokande Collaboration), *Phys. Rev. Lett. 81*, 1562 (1998); *82*, 2644 (1999).

[2] C. Pati and A. Salam, *Phys. Rev.* **D 10**, 275 (1974).
R. N. Mohapatra and J. C. Pati, *Phys. Rev.* **D11**, 566 (1975).
R. N. Mohapatra and G. Senjanovic, *Phys. Rev.* **D23**, 165 (1981).
D. Chang, R. N. Mohapatra and M. K. Parida, *Phys. Rev.* **D30**, 1052(1984). Other references therein.

[3] P. Duka, J. Gluza and M. Zralek, *Ann. Phys. (NY)* **280**,336(2000). arXiv:hep-ph/9910279. Other references therein.

[4] F. F. Deppisch, T. E. Gonzalo, S. Patra, N. Sahu and U. Sarkar, *Phys. Rev.* **D 91**, 015018 (2015), arXiv:1410.6427 [hep-ph].; F. F. Deppisch, L. Graf, S. Kulkarni, S. Patra, W. Rodejohann, N. Sahu and U. Sarkar. arXiv:1508.05940 [hep-ph], and other references therein.

[5] S. Patra, F. S. Queiroz and W. Rodejohann, arXiv:1506.03456 [hep-ph].

[6] P. S. Bhupal Dev, R. N. Mohapatra, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **115**, 181803 (2015); arXiv:1508.02277 [hep-ph]; P. S. Bhupal Dev, Chang-Hun Lee, R. N. Mohapatra,*Phys. Rev.* **D 88**, 093010(2013); arXiv:1309.0774 [hep-ph]

[7] D. Borah, S. Patra and U. Sarkar, *Phys. Rev.* **D 83**, 035007(2011).

[8] J. Chay, K. Y. Lee and S. H. Nam, *Phys. Rev.* **D 61**, 035002(1999). arXiv:hep-ph/9809298; V. Cirigliano, A. Kurylov, M. J. Ramsey-Musolf and P. Vogel, *Phys. Rev.* **D70**, 075007(2004); Zhi-zhong Xing, arXiv:1406.7739; J. Heeck and S. Patra, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **115**, 121804 (2015); arXiv:1507.01584; F. Siringo, *Eur. Phys. J.* **C32**, 555(2004). arXiv:hep-ph/0307320; J. Hetzel, arXiv:1504.06739; J. Yepes, arXiv:1507.03974[hep-ph];J. Yepes, R. Kunming, J. Shu, arXiv:1507.04745[hep-ph].

[9] P. Minkowski, *Phys.Lett.* **B 67** 421 (1977).
[10] T. Yanagida, in *Proc. of the Workshop on the Unified Theory and Baryon Number in the Universe*, ed. O. Sawada and A. Sugamoto(KEK report 79-18), 95(1979).
[11] M. Gell-Mann, P. Ramond and R. Slansky, in Supergravity, edited by P. van Nieuwenhuizen and D. Z. Freedman(North Polland, Amsterdam) (1979), p. 315.
[12] E. Masso, *Phys.Rev.Lett.* **52** 1956 (1984); F. I. Olness and M. E. Ebel, *Phys.Rev.* **D 30** 1034 (1984); G. Bhattacharyya, A. Datta, A. Raychaudhuri and U. Sarkar, *Phys.Rev.* **D 47** 3693 (1993).
[13] P. Langacker and S. U. Sankar, *Phys.Rev.* **D 40** 1569 (1989).
[14] G. Altarelli, R. Casalbuoni, S. D. Curtis, N. D. Bartolomeo, F. Feruglio and R. Gatto, *Phys.Lett.* **B 263** 459 (1991).
[15] V. Barger, K. Cheung and P. Langacker, *Phys.Lett.* **B 381** 226 (1996).
[16] J. Brehmer, J. Hewett, J. Kopp, T. Rizzo and J. Tattersall, arXiv:1507.00012 [hep-ph].
[17] G. Konisi, Z. Maki, M. Nakahara and T. Saito, *Prog. Theor. Phys.* **101**, 1105(1999).
[18] N. G. Deshpande, J. F. Gunion, B. Kayser and F. Olness, *Phys. Rev.* **D 44**, 837(1991), .